

**ECONOMIC COMMISSION FOR EUROPE**

**MEETING OF THE PARTIES TO THE  
CONVENTION ON THE PROTECTION  
AND USE OF TRANSBOUNDARY  
WATERCOURSES AND  
INTERNATIONAL LAKES**

**CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO  
THE CONVENTION ON THE  
TRANSBOUNDARY EFFECTS OF  
INDUSTRIAL ACCIDENTS**

**Intergovernmental Working Group  
on Civil Liability**

Sixth meeting  
Geneva, 15-17 January 2003

Working paper

MP.WAT/AC.3/2003/WP. 28  
CP.TEIA/AC.1/2003/WP. 28

ENGLISH ONLY

10 January 2003

**ACCESS TO INFORMATION AND JUSTICE**

Introduction

At the fifth meeting, the Working Group considered two working papers of relevance to article 11bis: one prepared by the secretariat and issued as working paper MP.WAT/AC.3/2002/WP.19 - CP.TEIA/AC.1/2002/WP.19; and the other prepared by the Environmental Law Centre and issued as working paper MP.WAT/AC.3/2002/WP.19 - CP.TEIA/AC.1/2002/WP.19. The present working paper combines both proposals.

## **Article 11bis**

### **Access to information and justice accordingly**

1. As a complement to the requirements of this Protocol for Parties to make available specific information or documents, each Party shall take steps within the framework of its legislation to make available to the public information as is held by public authorities and is reasonably needed to inform public discussion of civil liability and adequate and prompt compensation for damage resulting from the transboundary effects of industrial accidents on transboundary waters.
  
2. Where a Party to this Protocol is a Party to the 1998 Convention on Access to Information, Public Participation in Decision-making and Access to Justice in Environmental Matters (hereinafter referred to as 1998 Aarhus Convention), compliance by public authorities of that Party with the requirements of that Convention in relation to public information under paragraph 1 of this article and access to justice shall satisfy the requirement in respect of this article. Where a Party to this Protocol is not a Party to the 1998 Aarhus Convention, the Party shall provide access to information and access to justice in accordance with annex IV of this Protocol.
  
3. The person who suffered damage and/or who is entitled to a right of recourse under the Protocol may, in bringing the claim for compensation, request the competent court or arbitral tribunal established under article 13 (bis) to order an operator to disclose the specific information in so far this is necessary to identify the scope of liability. The operator shall bear the costs of preparing the information, unless the claim for compensation proves to be unwarranted.

## Annex IV

### **Provision of access to information and access to justice by non-Parties to the 1998 Aarhus Convention**

1. Each Party that is not a Party to the 1998 Aarhus Convention shall ensure that public authorities, in response to a request for information relevant to civil liability and adequate and prompt compensation for damage resulting from the transboundary effects of industrial accidents on transboundary waters, make such information available within a reasonable time to the public, within the framework of national legislation.

2. The Parties shall ensure that information referred to in paragraph 1 of this annex shall be available to the public at all reasonable times for inspection free of charge, and shall provide members of the public with reasonable facilities for obtaining from the Parties, on payment of reasonable charges, copies of such information.

3. Nothing in this Protocol shall require a public authority to publish information referred to in paragraph 1 or make this information available to the public if:

(a) The public authority does not hold the information;

(b) The request for the information is manifestly unreasonable or formulated in too general a manner; or

(c) The information concerns material in the course of completion or concerns internal communications of public authorities where such an exemption is provided for in national law or customary practice, taking into account the public interest served by disclosure.

4. Nothing in this Protocol shall require a public authority to publish information relevant to civil liability and adequate and prompt compensation for damage resulting from the transboundary effects of industrial accidents on transboundary waters or make this information available to the public if disclosure of the information would adversely affect:

(a) The confidentiality of the proceedings of public authorities, where such confidentiality is provided for under national law;

(b) International relations, national defence or public security;

(c) The course of justice, the ability of a person to receive a fair trial or the ability of a public authority to conduct an enquiry of a criminal or disciplinary nature;

(d) The confidentiality of commercial or industrial information, where such confidentiality is protected by law in order to protect a legitimate economic interest. Within this framework, information on emissions and discharges which are relevant for the protection of the environment shall be disclosed;

(e) Intellectual property rights;

(f) The confidentiality of personal data and/or files relating to a natural person where that person has not consented to the disclosure of the information to the public, where such confidentiality is provided for in national law;

(g) The interests of a third party which has supplied the information requested without that party being under, or being capable of being put under, a legal obligation to do so, and where that party does not consent to the release of the material; or

(h) The environment to which the information relates, such as the breeding sites of rare species.

These grounds for not disclosing information shall be interpreted in a restrictive way, taking into account the public interest served by disclosure and taking into account whether the information relates to emissions and discharges into the environment.

5. Each Party shall, within the framework of its national legislation, ensure that any person who considers that his or her request for information under article 11bis has been ignored, wrongfully refused, whether in part or in full, inadequately answered, or otherwise not dealt with in accordance with the provisions of that article, has access to a review procedure before a court of law or another independent and impartial body established by law. In the circumstances where a Party provides for such a review by a court of law, it shall ensure that such a person also has access to an expeditious procedure established by law that is free of charge or inexpensive for reconsideration by a public authority or review by an independent and impartial body other than a court of law. Final decisions under this paragraph shall be binding on the public authority holding the information. Reasons shall be stated in writing, at least where access to information is refused under this paragraph.