

**To: Members of the Bureau of the UNECE Expert Group on Resource Classification**

From: David MacDonald, Jim Ross and Hari Tulsidas

Conference Calls of the Bureau of the Expert Group on Resource Classification (EGRC) 14 December 2016 MINUTES
---

Present on 9 am GMT call:

1. Jim Ross (Petroleum sector) Chaired the meeting
2. Tunde Arisekola (NGSA)
3. Rodrigo Channes *representing* Anne Auffret (European Commission)
4. Frank Denelle (Chair, Renewables Task Force) *representing* Gioia Falcone
5. Charlotte Griffiths (UNECE)
6. Hari Tulsidas (UNECE)

Present on 3 pm GMT call:

1. Jim Ross (Petroleum sector) Chaired the meeting
2. Rodrigo Channes *representing* Anne Auffret (European Commission)
3. David Elliott (Financial reporting sector)
4. Adrienne Hanly (IAEA)
5. Kjell Reider Knudsen (Norwegian Petroleum Directorate)
6. Michael Lynch-Bell (Financial reporting and solid minerals)
7. John Ritter (SPEE)
8. Danny Trotman (Financial reporting)
9. Brad Van Gosen (USGS)
10. Radoslav Vukas (Serbia)
11. Charlotte Griffiths (UNECE)
12. Hari Tulsidas (UNECE)

Observers:

11. John Etherington (TAG Chair, *observer*)

Apologies:

1. David MacDonald (EGRC Chair)
2. Karin Ask (Petroleum sector)
3. Anne Auffret (European Commission)
4. Fatih Birol (IEA)
5. Roger Dixon (CRIRSCO)
6. Mucella Ersoy (Turkish Coal Enterprises)
7. Gioia Falcone (Geothermal sector and academia)
8. Bernard Seiller (SPE)
9. Igor Shpurov (GKZ Russian Federation)
10. Adichat Surinkum (CCOP)
11. Narendra Verma (Petroleum sector)

Draft Agenda for EGRC Bureau Calls on 14 December 2016

1. Approval of draft agenda (Attachment 1)
2. Draft minutes of Bureau calls of 1 November (Attachment 2)
3. EXCOM and Committee on Sustainable Energy 25th Session Part II - Update (Attachments 3, 4 & 5)

4. EGRC Eighth Session, 25–28 April 2017 (Attachments 6 & 7)
5. G axis update
6. Guidance Note on Competent Person
7. Technical Advisory Group Update (Attachment 8)
8. Chinese petroleum and solid mineral systems bridging update
9. Update on application of UNFC to Renewable Energy Resources
10. Proposed SEC Rules - Modernization of Disclosures for Mining
11. E axis Sub-group update
12. Update on application of UNFC to Nuclear Fuel Resources
13. Update on application of UNFC to Injection Projects
14. UNFC Revision
15. Update on Cooperation with African Minerals Development Centre
16. Update on EU Mining the European Anthroposphere (MINEA) Project
17. Cooperation with “Towards a World Forum for Raw Materials” (FORAM) Project
18. Education and outreach (Attachment 9)
19. Date of next Bureau calls
20. Any other business

Documentation:

1. Draft Agenda for Bureau Calls on 14 December 2016
2. Draft Minutes of 1 November 2016 Bureau Calls
3. Concept note and draft outcome document for 8th International Forum on Energy for Sustainable Development and Energy Ministerial
4. Concept Note Green Technology Centre
5. Note verbale Kazakhstan re Green Technology Centre
6. Draft Annotated Agenda for EGRC Eighth Session
7. Draft Work Plan for EGRC 2018–2019
8. Draft Minutes of TAG Call of 30 September 2016
9. List of events promoting UNFC in 2016–2017 as at 5 December 2016

1. As Dave MacDonald could not attend the call due to urgent business travel, Jim Ross chaired the meeting.

**Item 1. Approval of Draft Agenda**

2. The Chair welcomed Rodrigo Chanes, EC DG GROWTH to the Bureau. Rodrigo is nominated as Anne Auffret’s alternate replacing Mr. Slavko Solar.
3. The agenda as proposed was adopted without amendment.

**Item 2. Draft minutes of Bureau calls of 1 November 2016**

Documentation: Draft minutes of Bureau calls of 1 November 2016

4. Kjell Reider Knudsen pointed out the omission of his name from the list of apologies. With this correction, the draft minutes of the Bureau calls of 1 November was adopted without further amendment.

**Item 3. EXCOM and Committee on Sustainable Energy 25th Session Part II - Update**

Documentation: Concept note and draft outcome document for 8th International Forum on Energy for Sustainable Development and Energy Ministerial; Concept Note Green Technology Centre; and Note verbale Kazakhstan re Green Technology Centre

5. In the UNECE Executive Committee meeting held on 18 November, member States were supportive of EGRC activities and UNFC. The EU and the Russian Federation both spoke up with positive comments. Very strong support for the Russian Federation Oil & Gas Bridging Document, endorsed by the Committee on Sustainable Energy on 30 September was also expressed in the meeting.

6. Three documents for comments were sent out on 8 December:

- i. Concept note and draft outcome document for 8th International Forum on Energy for Sustainable Development and Energy Ministerial;
- ii. Concept Note Green Technology Centre; and
- iii. Note verbale Kazakhstan re Green Technology Centre.

7. The EGRC Chair provided the following comments on the above documents during the Committee on Sustainable Energy Bureau call on 12 December: (i) EGRC supports the outcome document's emphasis on attaining the energy-related SDGs and implementation of the NDCs, based on a thorough analysis of the gaps and the challenges ahead; and (ii) UNFC should be included in this document specifically, as the text mentions activities that will be of reference to the UNFC such as, promoting renewable energy within future energy systems, methane management in extractive industries carbon capture and storage and the water, food and energy nexus.

8. The Chair requested the Bureau members to study and provide comments if possible by 31 December.

9. It was also informed that all the subsidiary bodies of the Committee on Sustainable Energy are looking to identify cross-cutting areas and move away from working in silos. Hari Tulsidas and Charlotte Griffiths will identify opportunities for EGRC to work with other Groups of Experts and vice versa. The 25<sup>th</sup> Session of the Committee on Sustainable Energy, which will resume on 19 January 2016 will consider these proposals.

#### **Item 4. EGRC Eighth Session, 25–28 April 2017**

Documentation: Draft Annotated Agenda for EGRC Eighth Session; Draft Work Plan for EGRC 2018–2019

10. The Chair drew attention to the draft EGRC-8 Agenda which was circulated on 13 December. The draft agenda covers all the issues in the current EGRC work plan and needs to be finalised before end-January. Bureau members were requested to provide feedback by cob 15 January.

11. The draft Work Plan for 2018-2019 was also circulated on 13 December for comments. The Chair remarked that the Work Plan is very ambitious and dependent on extrabudgetary funds being identified if EGRC is to deliver on all the items. The draft Work Plan is an official document for the eighth session of EGRC. Comments that will be provided at the EGRC-8 meeting will be incorporated in a revised final draft that will be issued within two weeks following the EGRC meeting. This revised text will then be submitted to the Committee on Sustainable Energy for approval. Bureau members were requested to provide feedback by cob 22 January.

12. The Chair provided an update on the anticipated additional documents for the EGRC-8 meeting. In addition to the list of 14 official documents included in the Minutes of the Bureau call of 1 November, the Anthropogenic Working Group has been established (see Item 16 for more details). The WG is keen to issue the draft anthropogenic specifications and one related case study as official EGRC documents. There will be a need to review the submitted list of official documents to see if this can be accommodated i.e. if some of the other planned case studies are no longer going to be issued.

13. The Chair reminded the Bureau of the document deadlines for EGRC-8:

- Deadline for submission of the Agenda: 29 January 2017
- Deadline for submission of documents for translation: 13 February 2017
- Deadline for submission of English-only documents: 11 April 2017.

14. The Chair clarified that official draft documents should be received one month before the above deadlines for TAG review, Bureau approval and allowing time for formatting and submission. The Chair pointed out that the Bureau is likely to get some documents in early February for consideration with a one-week comment period. All those responsible for the preparation of draft documents should confirm by 20 December if they can meet the deadlines for submission to the TAG i.e. mid-January and 13 March 2017.

15. The Chair urged early submission to avoid last minute build-up of the draft documents for TAG and Bureau reviews.

#### **Item 5. G axis Update**

16. An update on the Working Group on G axis was provided by the Chair. The Working Group continues to work on two aspects:

- (i) how to make the make UNFC G-axis category definitions and supporting explanations more generic; and
- (ii) proposal for a possible change of name to the G axis.

17. Recommendations regarding the Working Group's proposals for possible changes to the G-axis name and the wording of the G category definitions and supporting explanations are being compiled. The report to the Bureau/EGRC will also include a review of the EGRC G axis name questionnaire. The report will be submitted for review by the Renewables Energy Task Force, and then it needs to go to the TAG and the Bureau for reviews and comments.

18. The Chair thanked the members of the G-axis Working Group for their efforts.

#### **Item 6. Guidance note on competent person**

19. The Chair briefed on the activities of the Working Group on Competent Persons. The WG is working to produce a short guidance note on CP for UNFC and a second more expansive guidance note detailing the issues around defining a competent person that will be published under the EGRC.

20. Both the draft documents are being reviewed by WG members and have also been shared with Renewable Energy Task Force. The WG is trying to see whether the UNFC CP

draft guidance will be ready for review by end-December and the second EGRC detailed guidance latest by mid-January.

21. The Chair of the Renewables Task Force advised that it may be premature to establish Competent Person guidelines for the renewables sector and that it may be preferable to await completion of the specifications for all renewable energy sources before finalising specific Competent Person guidance in relation to renewables.

22. The Chair expressed his appreciation to all members of the Working Group on Competent Persons.

### **Item 7. Technical Advisory Group Update**

Documentation: Draft Minutes of TAG Call of 30 September 2016

23. The minutes of the TAG Call, which was held on 30 September, were circulated as part of the documentation. The TAG held its last teleconference on 3 November; the next meeting is scheduled for 19 December.

24. An overview of the main TAG project updates was provided.

#### (i) Petroleum Case Studies

A draft Terms of Reference document has been finalised, and work is proceeding. It was noted that application of the new RF-2013 guidance is in the early stages and few examples are yet available. This study will extend into 2018; key issues and preliminary results will be discussed in the 2017 8th EGRC session.

#### (ii) E-Axis Study

Draft guidance on accommodating environmental and social considerations in UNFC-2009 will be submitted for TAG review in January 2017 with the goal of meeting the February 13 deadline for translated versions. A second “Concepts and Terminology” document will be submitted later.

#### (iii) UNFC-2009 Update Project

The TAG will prepare a list of issues and potential amendments to UNFC-2009 to be submitted to the Bureau “Revision working group” in January 2017.

25. The other main project updates are provided under the relevant agenda items. The Chair thanked John Etherington and other TAG members for their continued hard work.

### **Item 8. Chinese petroleum and solid mineral systems bridging update**

26. The Chair updated on the status of bridging exercise. The draft documents are currently under review by the MLR (Ministry of Land and Resources) and will be released to the TAG in early 2017. A workshop is tentatively scheduled in Beijing for February 2017.

27. The Chair informed that the MLR is planning to have the bridging documents introduced as official documents during the EGRC meeting with the intent to sign them. The Chair mentioned that it was explained to Yang Hua, the focal point in China for the bridging documents, that the documents would need to go to the Committee on Sustainable Energy in September for final approval.

28. The TAG, which is guiding this activity has expressed the opinion that it will be challenging to have the TAG reviewed and Bureau endorsed bridging documents available for the April 2017 EGRC meeting.

29. The Chair thanked John Etherington, Roger Dixon and other TAG members for supporting this work.

### **Item 9. Update on application of UNFC to Renewable Energy Resources**

30. Frank Denelle representing Gioia Falcone provided an update on RE Task Force activities. It was mentioned that the RE Task Force has proposed that Frank be the alternate to Gioia in the future.

31. The RE Task Force organised a workshop 5–6 December, which was hosted by Cranfield University, UK. Good discussions and progress were made. All work on bioenergy, geothermal and solar were reviewed in the workshop. An action plan for work in 2017 has been prepared. It is planned that the wind and hydro work will start in January 2017.

32. Some of the key outcomes from the workshop are:

(i) The RE Task Force will put together FAQs for Renewable Energy Classification, potentially for the UNECE website. The work on FAQs has been partially started already by the Geothermal WG but will be expanded to include inputs from the other RE WGs.

(ii) All RE WGs will prepare case studies to illustrate and substantiate the commodity specifications.

(iii) The RE Task Force will update its ToR (including membership, improved way of working and communication protocol) and get them approved as appropriate.

(iv) The need for funding is a priority for work to continue. The RE Task Force will explore possibilities for funding.

(v) The RE Task Force is working on a stakeholder management plan to identify which stakeholders to reach out to and to avoid duplication and to coordinate contact with stakeholders.

(vi) The RE Task Force is seeking Bureau's direction on guidance for estimation/quantification versus classification.

(vii) The RE Task Force has requested for a dedicated future call with the Bureau on governance of the classification system (framework and documents) for each stage of developments of the texts (write, maintain, disseminate) (ownership, leadership, maintenance).

#### Bioenergy Specifications update

33. The WG aims to have an early draft to TAG for review by the end of 2016. The final draft is expected to be available by 18 January. If this deadline is not met, then this will be submitted as an English-only document to the EGRC.

34. The Chair thanked James Primrose and other team members of the WG for the substantial progress made.

#### Geothermal Working Group update

35. Case studies are being reviewed for publication as a UNECE document in 2017.

36. The Chair thanked Gioia Falcone for volunteering to continue to lead the Geothermal WG.

#### Solar Working Group update

37. A Solar Working Group has been established with Jeremy Webb as its Chair. It now has 15 members, including from IEA and IRENA. A workshop meeting of the Solar Working Group was held at Sunbury on 6–7 October.

38. A zero draft of the Solar Specifications has been prepared and was discussed at the meeting. The intent is to present the first draft at the EGRC 8th session following a TAG review by early March.

39. A Solar WG workshop is planned in London, 20-21 March 2017.

40. The Chair thanked Jeremy Webb and other members of Solar Working Group for their time and support.

#### Wind and Hydropower Specifications

41. Frank Denelle informed that he will initiate the Wind and Hydropower WGs shortly. He has identified an expert from Shell to lead the Wind WG.

42. The Chair thanked Frank Denelle and the other members of the RE Task Force for their time and support.

#### **Item 10. Proposed SEC Rules - Modernization of Disclosures for Mining**

43. An update was provided by the Chair on the Securities Exchange Commission, USA (SEC) call for comments for modernization of disclosure rules for mining. The deadline for comments was on 26 August 2016.

44. It was informed that the new Mineral Resource definition proposes to include geothermal fields and brines.

45. CRIRSCO's comment, which is available on the SEC website, says that the Template has specific reference to solid minerals and cannot be applied to geothermal and brines, as they are fundamentally different. CRIRSCO, therefore, suggests that separate requirements be developed which deal with these resources, following the same general principles, but including industry specific considerations.

46. The Chair remarked that, since the UNFC Geothermal specifications are now available, the SEC could be informed. Comments received after the deadline will probably not be considered. Nevertheless, it was agreed that the EGRC Chair should write to the SEC highlighting the fact that the UNFC already incorporates geothermal specifications and that

specifications for other renewable energy sources (bioenergy, solar, wind, hydro) are under development.

47. The SEC proposal also includes areas such as Qualified Person and responsibility for disclosure and social and environmental considerations. The Chair requested the respective working groups (Competent Person and E-axis) study the document. The link (<https://www.sec.gov/rules/proposed/2016/33-10098.pdf>) has been provided to the WG chairs.

#### **Item 11. E axis Sub-group**

48. David Elliott, Chair of the E axis Sub-group, provided an update. As noted on the last Bureau call on 1 November, two reports are planned for the next EGRC meeting. Additional comments on the two draft documents, pointed out in the minutes of the last teleconference, have recently been received from some sub-committee members. The comments will be reviewed and the documents edited as appropriate.

49. The plan is to have a final draft circulated to the sub-committee members for their comments by the end of December, with limited time for feedback. The revised documents will be provided to the TAG in January, and depending on feedback will be subject to further editing.

50. The “Concepts and Terminology” document is planned as an English-only document. Since there is an ongoing discussion on this, it will be submitted later.

51. The geological, engineering and economic aspects of resource assessment are relatively well established, with generally accepted standards, but this is not the case for the social and environmental aspects that have become so prominent recently.

52. David Elliott mentioned that the TOR of the E-axis sub-group had been advisedly limited to the immediate aspects of classification under the UNFC. However, thought needs to be given on how to interface with the broader issues such as is represented by the Global Reporting Initiative (GRI) or the UN System of Environmental-Economic Accounting (SEEA) to develop similar standards for classification. This should form part of the next phase of this exercise.

53. The Chair thanked Dave Elliott and the other Sub-group members for their continued efforts.

#### **Item 12. Update on application of UNFC to Nuclear Fuel Resources**

54. Adrienne Hanly, the Chair of the Task Force, provided an update. The work on drafting the Uranium/Thorium Best Practices Handbook is progressing well. A Consultancy Meeting is proposed to be held during the UNECE Resources Classification Week, April in Geneva. A Workshop is planned in Argentina in 2017, and the possibility of another workshop will be looked at.

55. The Jordan case study (on uranium) has been reviewed and is now with the authors for final modifications. This case study is expected to be submitted to TAG by the end of December.



56. Brad Van Gosen mentioned that case studies from Argentina, Mexico, Nigeria and Indonesia are under review by the TF. Following the Mongolia Workshop in August 2016, it was anticipated that up to 25 case studies on nuclear fuel resources, renewables, solid minerals, and water might be developed over the next two years. The Task Force will undertake a well-structured review of the case studies; the TAG will be depending mostly on the TF recommendations.

57. The Chair thanked Adrienne and the other Task Force members for their dedication and hard work.

### **Item 13. Update on application of UNFC to Injection Projects**

58. John Ritter informed that the Storage Resources Management System (SRMS), which is under development, is currently planned to be next reviewed with the SPE CCUS (Carbon Dioxide Capture, Utilization and Storage Technical Section – Technical Committee).

59. Following the review, the draft will be circulated to the SPE sister societies and some other focal groups for comment. Public review is slated for some time in the 2nd Q 2017.

### **Item 14. UNFC Revision**

60. As informed in the previous call on 1 November, a small working group has been established comprising:

- Dave MacDonald
- Kjell Reidar Knudsen
- Hari Tulsidas
- Charlotte Griffiths

61. A draft ToR for the UNFC Revision WG and timeline for the revision process has been developed and is under review by the WG. It will be circulated to the Bureau shortly.

### **Item 15. Update on Cooperation with African Minerals Development Centre**

62. The Chair informed that the UNECE Executive Committee was advised of the intent to sign an MOU with AMDC and that no comments or objections were raised. It has been forwarded to AMDC for signature. AMDC subsequently informed that the MoU is also being reviewed by the UN Economic Commission for Africa (UNECA). It was suggested that while cooperation between AMDC and UNECE can have an MOU, the same is not required between two regional commissions. Further feedback from AMDC is awaited.

### **Item 16. Update on EU Mining the European Anthroposphere (MINEA) Project**

63. The Chair informed that a Working Group on Anthropogenic Resources had been established. This work is being carried out under the European Cooperation in Science and Technology (COST) Mining the European Anthroposphere (MINEA) project. Soraya Heuss-Abbichler from LMU München is chairing this Group. Approximately 15 members have indicated a willingness to work in the Group. The WG has begun work on draft specifications. The first meeting of the Working Group was held in Budapest 6-7 Oct 2016.

64. The WG will hold its second meeting on 23-24 February 2017 in Ljubljana. The team will aim to produce initial draft specifications by 10 March. If possible, one case study will also be provided by 10 March. The WG will also create a flyer (similar to the RE brochure).

65. The Chair informed that the MINEA project had requested an EGRC Bureau member to be nominated as an Observer to the Management Committee. Radoslav Vukas has been suggested as suitable for the role. The Chair sought Bureau approval for nominating Radoslav Vukas as a Management Committee Observer in MINEA. This proposal was approved unanimously by the Bureau.

#### **Item 17. Cooperation with “Towards a World Forum for Raw Materials” (FORAM) Project**

66. The Chair advised of UNECE’s participation in FORAM, an EU Horizon 2020 funded project aimed to advance the idea of a World Forum on Raw Materials and enhance the global cooperation on raw materials policies and investments. The objective of FORAM is to build an EU-based platform of international experts and stakeholders to work together and make the complex environment of the existing initiatives related to raw materials more efficient.

67. The FORAM project is managed by the World Resources Forum Association and has the participation of a consortium of 11 European and non-European partners from Government, industry, academia and research institutes.

68. UNECE was invited to be a member of the Project Advisory Board. Hari Tulsidas and Charlotte Griffiths represent UNECE in the FORAM Advisory Board.

69. The kick-off meeting was held in Brussels, 28-29 February, as part of EU Raw Materials Week. Hari Tulsidas participated in the meeting. The meeting reviewed Work Packages 1 and 2 to be delivered during the first year of the project. Work Package 1 will assemble the baseline data on current initiatives and databases. UNFC will be considered as a tool to rank the quality of these sources. Work Package 2 will be on stakeholder engagement and on forming specific interest groups.

70. When in Brussels, Hari Tulsidas also met with Rodrigo Channes, EC DG GROWTH – Rodrigo has replaced Slavko Solar as the European Commission’s alternative on the Bureau. There will be continued support for UNFC.

#### **Item 18. Education and outreach**

Documentation: List of events promoting UNFC in 2016–2017 *as at 5 December 2016*

71. A number of events were highlighted:

(i) EFG UNFC Conference, Brussels: Planned to be held during 9–10 February 2017 in Brussels. It will be held in cooperation with the European Commission and the European Parliament. The conference is seeking the support of stakeholders and trying to identify support for speakers.

(ii) Workshop on Coal Mine Methane: A workshop will be held in Kolkata, 7-8 March 2017. Hari Tulsidas will attend and present on UNFC.

(iii) SPE ATCE 2017 in San Antonio, USA, October 2017: There are plans to submit an abstract on the RF2013 and UNFC Bridging Document.

(iv) The AAPG Annual Conference is planned for Houston in April 2017.

(v) Nigerian Mining and Geosciences Society, Abuja, 26-31 March 2017

**Item 19. Date of next Bureau calls**

72. The next Bureau calls are planned to be held during 16 – 27 January. The usual availability notice will be circulated.

**Item 20. Any other business**

73. The Chair sought the attention of the Bureau of the following additional matter of interest:

(i) Nomenclature for EGRC Sub-groups

74. The Chair suggested that there needs to be a uniform naming system for EGRC Task Forces, Working Groups, Sub-Committees, and Sub-groups. The suggestion is to rename all Sub-groups as:

(a) Working Groups - for longer term functions in different sectors. The WGs can have Sub-groups under them.

(b) Task Forces - for short term defined tasks.

75. The Chair asked all Bureau members to consider the proposal and provide their feedback if any before or during the next Bureau call.

\*\*\*\*\*