

*Economic Commission for Europe*  
*Geneva*

# ECONOMIC SURVEY OF EUROPE

2001 No. 2

*Prepared by the*  
SECRETARIAT OF THE  
ECONOMIC COMMISSION FOR EUROPE  
GENEVA



UNITED NATIONS  
New York and Geneva, 2001

## **NOTE**

The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the Secretariat of the United Nations concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area, or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries.

UNITED NATIONS PUBLICATION

Sales No. E.01.II.E.26

ISBN 92-1-116793-0  
ISSN 0070-8712

Copyright © United Nations, 2001  
All rights reserved  
Printed at United Nations, Geneva (Switzerland)

## CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
<i>Explanatory notes</i> .....	<i>viii</i>
<i>Abbreviations</i> .....	<i>ix</i>
<i>About the main contributors to the Seminar</i> .....	<i>xi</i>
<i>Preface</i> .....	<i>xii</i>

### Part One

#### ***RECENT ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENTS AND THE SHORT-RUN OUTLOOK IN THE ECE REGION***

<i>Chapter 1</i> <b>THE ECE ECONOMIES IN AUTUMN 2001</b> .....	3
1.1    The global context and western Europe .....	3
(i)    The global context .....	3
(ii)    Western Europe .....	10
1.2    The transition economies .....	14
(i)    Introduction .....	14
(ii)    Output and demand .....	16
(iii)    Costs and prices .....	24
(iv)    Labour markets .....	27
(v)    International trade .....	30
(vi)    Current accounts and external financing .....	36
1.3    The short-term oulook .....	40
(i)    The western market economies .....	40
(ii)    The transition economies .....	43

### Part Two

#### ***CREATING A SUPPORTIVE ENVIRONMENT FOR BUSINESS ENTERPRISE AND ECONOMIC GROWTH: INSTITUTIONAL REFORM AND GOVERNANCE***

*Papers from the ECE Spring Seminar, May 2001*

<i>INTRODUCTION AND SUMMARY OF DISCUSSION by the Economic Analysis Division, UNECE</i> .....	49
<i>Chapter 2</i> <b>PUBLIC AND CORPORATE GOVERNANCE: THE INSTITUTIONAL FOUNDATIONS OF THE MARKET ECONOMY</b>	
<i>William Lazonick</i> .....	59
2.1    The triumph of the “market economy”? .....	59
2.2    The theory of the market economy .....	61
2.3    Innovation and development in a market economy .....	63
2.4    The social conditions of innovative enterprise .....	65
2.5    Economic theory and economic development .....	70
<i>Discussants' comments on Professor Lazonick's paper</i>	
2.A    Victor Polterovich .....	73
2.B    Eugen Jurzyca .....	75

<b>Chapter 3</b>	<b>INSTITUTIONAL CHANGE AND ECONOMIC PERFORMANCE IN THE TRANSITION ECONOMIES</b>	
<i>Paul G. Hare</i> .....		77
3.1	Introduction .....	77
(i)	Political configuration .....	78
(ii)	State capacity .....	78
(iii)	State objectives .....	78
(iv)	Outline of paper .....	79
3.2	Institutional change – concepts and definitions .....	79
(i)	Definitions .....	79
(ii)	Typical institutions .....	80
(iii)	Economic behaviour with missing institutions .....	80
(iv)	Theories of institutional change .....	81
3.3	Institutional change in transition economies .....	83
3.4	Links between institutional change and economic performance .....	86
(i)	Macroeconomic studies .....	86
(ii)	Enterprise level studies .....	88
3.5	Conclusions and policy implications .....	91
(i)	Findings and conclusions .....	91
(ii)	Institutions .....	91
(iii)	Policy implications .....	92
<i>Discussants' comments on Professor Hare's paper</i>		
3.A	Danica Popovic .....	95
3.B	László Csaba .....	97
<b>Chapter 4</b>	<b>CORRUPTION IN ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT: GREASE OR SAND?</b>	
<i>Shang-Jin Wei</i> .....		101
4.1	Introduction .....	101
4.2	Corruption: which corruption? .....	101
(i)	Corruption ratings based on “expert opinions” .....	102
(ii)	Corruption ratings based on surveys of firms or citizens .....	102
(iii)	Corruption ratings based on “a poll of polls” .....	102
(iv)	Corruption ratings based on more “objective” and “harder” data .....	103
4.3	Corruption and economic growth .....	103
(i)	Rate of economic growth .....	103
(ii)	Firm-level evidence .....	104
(iii)	Quality of growth .....	106
4.4	Corruption in a globalizing world .....	107
(i)	Corruption reduces the benefits of globalization: a specific example on transition economies ...	107
(ii)	Corruption increases the risks of globalization .....	107
4.5	Corruption control: what can be done? .....	108
(i)	Opportunities derived from government’s role in the economy .....	108
(ii)	Civil servant recruitment and promotion system .....	109
(iii)	Compensation for civil servants .....	109
(iv)	Other elements in an anti-corruption strategy .....	110
(v)	International pressure .....	111
(vi)	Political economy considerations and “special governance zones” .....	112
4.6	Concluding remarks .....	112
<i>Discussants' comments on Professor Wei's paper</i>		
4.A	Krassen Stanchev .....	113
4.B	Ivo Bićanić .....	115

<i>Chapter 5 GOVERNANCE IN TRANSITION: THE CHALLENGE OF SUBVERTING CORRUPTION</i>	
<i>Antoni Z. Kamiński and Bartłomiej Kamiński .....</i>	117
5.1 Introduction .....	117
5.2 Corruption, governance and transition .....	119
(i) Corruption in post-communist societies and progress in transition.....	119
(ii) Strategic political choices during transition .....	125
(iii) Conclusion .....	132
5.3 Governance and combating corruption .....	133
(i) Capture of policies by narrow interest groups: democracies versus electocracies .....	135
(ii) Combating administrative corruption .....	137
(iii) NGOs and independent media .....	140
(iv) Concluding comments .....	141
5.4 Corruption and development: policy convergence .....	141
5.5 Conclusion .....	143
<i>Discussants' comments on Professors A. and B. Kamińskis' paper</i>	
5.A Mark Pieth .....	144
5.B Jorge Braga de Macedo .....	145

## Part Three

### *STATISTICAL APPENDIX*

<i>STATISTICAL APPENDIX .....</i>	149
<i>Corrections to <i>Economic Survey of Europe, 2001 No. 1</i> .....</i>	178

## LIST OF TABLES

<i>Table</i>		<i>Page</i>
1.1.1	Quarterly changes in real GDP, 2000 QI-2001 QII .....	5
1.1.2	Quarterly changes in real GDP and main expenditure items, 2001 QI-2001 QII .....	7
1.2.1	Basic economic indicators for the ECE transition economies, 1999-2002 .....	15
1.2.2	International trade and external balances of the ECE transition economies, 1999-2001 .....	16
1.2.3	GDP and industrial output in the ECE transition economies, 2000-2001 .....	17
1.2.4	Volume of retail trade in selected transition economies, 2000-2001 .....	18
1.2.5	Consumer prices, industrial producer prices and labour costs in industry in the ECE transition economies, 2000-2001 .....	26
1.2.6	Total employment and registered unemployment in the transition economies, 1998-2001 .....	28
1.2.7	Foreign trade of the ECE transition economies by direction, 1999-2001 .....	31
1.2.8	Changes in the volume of foreign trade in selected transition economies, 1997-2001 .....	32
1.2.9	CIS countries' trade with CIS and non-CIS countries, 1999-2001 .....	36
1.2.10	Current account balances of the ECE transition economies, 2000-2001 .....	37
1.2.11	Foreign direct investment in the ECE economies, 2000-2001 .....	38
1.2.12	Net capital flows into the ECE transition economies, 2000-2001 .....	39
1.2.13	Net capital flows into eastern Europe, the Baltic states and selected members of the CIS, by type of capital, 1999-2001 .....	40
1.3.1	Changes in the consensus forecasts of economic growth in 2001 and 2002 .....	41
1.3.2	Real GDP in the ECE market economies, 1999-2002 .....	42
3.3.1	Economic growth and inflation in selected transition economies, 1989-2000 .....	84
3.3.2	Progress with institutional reform in selected transition economies .....	85
3.3.3	Indicators of legal reform and effectiveness in selected transition economies .....	86
4.2.1	Measures of corruption in the transition economies of Europe and the CIS .....	103
4.5.1	How much should civil servants' legal pay be increased to lower corruption? .....	110
5.2.1	Measures of corruption and governance in the CEECs and the CIS .....	122

<i>Table</i>		<i>Page</i>
A.1	Real GDP in western Europe, North America and Japan, 1986-2000 .....	151
A.2	Real private consumption expenditure in western Europe, North America and Japan, 1986-2000 .....	152
A.3	Real general government consumption expenditure in western Europe, North America and Japan, 1986-2000 .....	153
A.4	Real gross domestic fixed capital formation in western Europe, North America and Japan, 1986-2000 .....	154
A.5	Real total domestic expenditures in western Europe, North America and Japan, 1986-2000 .....	155
A.6	Real exports of goods and services in western Europe, North America and Japan, 1986-2000 .....	156
A.7	Real imports of goods and services in western Europe, North America and Japan, 1986-2000 .....	157
A.8	Industrial output in western Europe, North America and Japan, 1986-2000 .....	158
A.9	Total employment in western Europe, North America and Japan, 1986-2000 .....	159
A.10	Standardized unemployment rates in western Europe, North America and Japan, 1986-2000 .....	160
A.11	Consumer prices in western Europe, North America and Japan, 1986-2000 .....	161
B.1	Real GDP/NMP in eastern Europe, the Baltic states and the CIS, 1980, 1987-2000 .....	162
B.2	Real total consumption expenditure in eastern Europe, the Baltic states and the CIS, 1980, 1987-2000 .....	163
B.3	Real gross fixed capital formation in eastern Europe, the Baltic states and the CIS, 1980, 1987-2000 .....	163
B.4	Real gross industrial output in eastern Europe, the Baltic states and the CIS, 1980, 1987-2000 .....	164
B.5	Total employment in eastern Europe, the Baltic states and the CIS, 1980, 1987-2000 .....	165
B.6	Employment in industry in eastern Europe, the Baltic states and the CIS, 1989-2000 .....	166
B.7	Registered unemployment in eastern Europe, the Baltic states and the CIS, 1990-2000 .....	167
B.8	Consumer prices in eastern Europe, the Baltic states and the CIS, 1990-2000 .....	168
B.9	Producer price indices in eastern Europe, the Baltic states and the CIS, 1990-2000 .....	169
B.10	Nominal gross wages in industry in eastern Europe, the Baltic states and the CIS, 1990-2000 .....	170
B.11	Merchandise exports of eastern Europe, the Baltic states and the CIS, 1980, 1988-2000 .....	171
B.12	Merchandise imports of eastern Europe, the Baltic states and the CIS, 1980, 1988-2000 .....	172
B.13	Balance of merchandise trade of eastern Europe, the Baltic states and the CIS, 1980, 1988-2000 .....	173
B.14	Merchandise trade of eastern Europe and the Russian Federation, by direction, 1980, 1988-2000 .....	174
B.15	Exchange rates of eastern Europe, the Baltic states and the CIS, 1980, 1988-2000 .....	175
B.16	Current account balances of eastern Europe, the Baltic states and the CIS, 1990-2000 .....	176
B.17	Inflows of foreign direct investment in eastern Europe, the Baltic states and the CIS, 1990-2000 .....	177

## *LIST OF CHARTS*

<i>Chart</i>		<i>Page</i>
1.1.1	Quarterly changes in real GDP in the developed market economies, 1999 QI-2001 QII .....	5
1.1.2	Monthly changes in industrial output, January 1995-August 2001 .....	5
1.1.3	International share prices, 4 January 1999 to 12 October 2001 .....	6
1.1.4	Business and consumer surveys in the United States, January 1995-September 2001 .....	8
1.1.5	United States labour market, January 2000-September 2001 .....	8
1.1.6	Consumer prices in the United States, January 2000-August 2001 .....	9
1.1.7	World commodity prices, January 1998-September 2001 .....	9
1.1.8	Business and consumer surveys in the European Union and the euro area, January 1995-September 2001 .....	11
1.1.9	Consumer prices in the euro area, January 2000-September 2001 .....	12
1.1.10	Standardized unemployment rates in the euro area and selected countries, January 1999-September 2001 .....	12
1.1.11	Short-term and long-term interest rates in the euro area, Japan and the United States, January 1999-September 2001 .....	13
1.2.1	Monthly dollar exports and imports in selected transition economies, 2000-2001 .....	33
2.4.1	Industrial, organizational and institutional conditions in the innovation process .....	67
5.2.1	Administrative corruption and state capture in transition economies .....	123
5.2.2	Progress in transition (governance) and corruption .....	125
5.B.1	G&G links to national economic performance .....	145
5.B.2	European institutional architecture .....	147

## *LIST OF BOXES*

<i>Box</i>		<i>Page</i>
1.2.1	Fiscal turmoil in Poland .....	20
1.2.2	The Elcoteq case .....	22
5.2.1	The 1997 Czech foreign exchange crisis and governance .....	128
5.3.1	Good economics and a corruption reducing measure: the case for a uniform tariff structure .....	139

## EXPLANATORY NOTES

The following symbols have been used throughout this *Survey*:

- .. = not available or not pertinent
- = nil or negligible
- \* = estimate by the secretariat of the Economic Commission for Europe
- | = break in series

In referring to a combination of years, the use of an oblique stroke (e.g. 1998/99) signifies a 12-month period (say, from 1 July 1998 to 30 June 1999). The use of a hyphen (e.g. 1998-2000) normally signifies either an average of, or a total for, the full period of calendar years covered (including the end-years indicated).

Unless the contrary is stated, the standard unit of weight used throughout is the metric ton. The definition of “billion” used throughout is a thousand million. The definition of “trillion” used throughout is a thousand billion. Minor discrepancies in totals and percentages are due to rounding.

References to dollars (\$) are to United States dollars unless otherwise specified.

The membership of the United Nations Economic Commission for Europe (UNECE) consists of all the states of western Europe, eastern Europe and the territory of the former Soviet Union, North America and Israel.

The term *transition economies*, as used in the text and tables of this publication, refers to the formerly centrally planned economies of the ECE regions. *Eastern Europe* refers to the economies of Albania, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Bulgaria, Croatia, the Czech Republic, Hungary, Poland, Romania, Slovakia, Slovenia, The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia and Yugoslavia. The *Baltic states* refers to Estonia, Latvia and Lithuania and the *CIS countries* refers to Armenia, Azerbaijan, Belarus, Georgia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Republic of Moldova, Russian Federation, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, Ukraine and Uzbekistan.

## ABBREVIATIONS

<b>BBC</b>	British Broadcasting Corporation
<b>BIS</b>	Bank for International Settlements
<b>CEE</b>	central and eastern Europe
<b>CEECs</b>	central and east European countries
<b>CEFTA</b>	Central European Free Trade Agreement
<b>CEO</b>	Chief Executive Officer
<b>CEPR</b>	Centre for Economic Policy Research
<b>CETE</b>	central European transition economies
<b>c.i.f.</b>	cost, insurance and freight
<b>CIS</b>	Commonwealth of Independent States
<b>CMEA</b>	(former) Council for Mutual Economic Assistance
<b>CPI</b>	corruption perception index
<b>EBRD</b>	European Bank for Reconstruction and Development
<b>ECB</b>	European Central Bank
<b>ECOSOC</b>	Economic and Social Council (of the United Nations)
<b>EMU</b>	economic and monetary union
<b>ESA</b>	European System of Integrated Economic Accounts
<b>EU</b>	European Union
<b>FCPA</b>	Foreign Corrupt Practices Act
<b>FDI</b>	foreign direct investment
<b>GATT</b>	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade
<b>GCR</b>	Global Competitiveness Report (corruption index)
<b>GDP</b>	gross domestic product
<b>GDR</b>	(former) German Democratic Republic
<b>G&amp;G</b>	globalization and governance
<b>GNP</b>	gross national product
<b>HS</b>	Harmonized Commodity Description and Coding System
<b>HWWA</b>	Hamburg Institute for Economic Research
<b>IATA</b>	International Air Transport Association
<b>ICRG</b>	International Country Risk Guide (corruption index)
<b>ICT</b>	information and communications technology
<b>IIF</b>	Institute of International Finance, Inc.
<b>ILO</b>	International Labour Office
<b>IMF</b>	International Monetary Fund
<b>INSEAD</b>	The European Institute of Business Administration
<b>IPO</b>	initial public offering
<b>LRS</b>	license requiring state
<b>M&amp;A</b>	mergers and acquisitions

<b>NACE</b>	Nomenclature générale des activités économiques dans les Communautés européennes (General Industrial Classification of Economic Activities within the European Communities)
<b>NAPM</b>	National Association of Purchasing Management
<b>NATO</b>	North Atlantic Treaty Organization
<b>NBER</b>	National Bureau of Economic Research, Inc.
<b>NGO</b>	non-governmental organization
<b>NMP</b>	net material product
<b>OECD</b>	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
<b>OPEC</b>	Organization of the Petroleum Exporting Countries
<b>OPT</b>	outward processing trade
<b>PHARE</b>	Assistance programmes for the countries of central and eastern Europe (of the EU)
<b>PMI</b>	Purchasing Managers' Index
<b>PPP</b>	purchasing power parity
<b>R&amp;D</b>	research and development
<b>RFE/RL</b>	Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty
<b>RPIX</b>	retail price index excluding mortgage interest payments
<b>SDR</b>	special drawing right
<b>SETE</b>	south-east European transition economies
<b>SGZ</b>	special governance zone
<b>SNA</b>	System of National Accounts
<b>TACIS</b>	Technical Assistance for the Commonwealth of Independent States (of the EU)
<b>TI</b>	Transparency International
<b>UNCTAD</b>	United Nations Conference on Trade and Development
<b>UNECE</b>	United Nations Economic Commission for Europe
<b>USSR</b>	(former) Union of Soviet Socialist Republics
<b>WDR</b>	World Development Report (corruption index)
<b>WTO</b>	World Trade Organization

## ABOUT THE MAIN CONTRIBUTORS TO THE SEMINAR

- *Ivo Bićanić*, University of Zagreb and Central European University, Budapest (iva.bicanic@zg.tel.hr)
- *Jorge Braga de Macedo*, OECD Development Centre, Paris (pamela.marqueyrol@oecd.org)
- *László Csaba*, Central European University and Budapest University of Economics and Public Administration, Budapest (csabal@ceu.hu)
- *Paul G. Hare*, Heriot-Watt University, Edinburgh (p.g.hare@hw.ac.uk)
- *Eugen Jurzyca*, Institute for Economic and Social Reforms and the Centre for Economic Development, Bratislava (jurzyca@ineko.sk)
- *Antoni Kamiński*, Institute of Political Science, Polish Academy of Sciences, Warsaw and Transparency International, Poland's Chapter (kaminski@omega.isppan.waw.pl)
- *Bartłomiej Kamiński*, University of Maryland, College Park, Maryland (bkaminski@worldbank.org)
- *William Lazonick*, University of Massachusetts Lowell and INSEAD (The European Institute of Business Administration), Fontainebleau (william.lazonick@insead.fr)
- *Mark Pieth*, University of Basle and Chairman of the OECD Working Group on Bribery in International Business Transactions (mark.pieth@unibas.ch)
- *Victor Polterovich*, Central Economics and Mathematics Institute, Russian Academy of Sciences and New Economic School, Moscow (victor@polter.mccme.rssi.ru)
- *Danica Popovic*, Univeristy of Belgrade, Belgrade (dpopovic@eunet.yu)
- *Krassen Stanchev*, Institute for Market Economics, Sofia (stanchev@ime.bg)
- *Shang-Jin Wei*, Harvard University and Brookings Institution, Washington (swei@brook.edu)

## P R E F A C E

The present *Survey* is the fifty-fourth in a series of annual reports prepared by the secretariat of the United Nations Economic Commission for Europe to serve the needs of the Commission and of the United Nations in reporting on and analysing world economic conditions.

Until 1997 the *Economic Survey of Europe* was issued once a year as was the *Economic Bulletin for Europe*, the secretariat's second publication, which focused on trade and payments issues. At its 52nd Session, in April 1997, the Commission decided to replace these two publications with an annual *Survey* of several issues. In 1998 and 1999 there were three issues each. There are now two issues a year published in April and November.

The Survey is published on the sole responsibility of the Executive Secretary of ECE and the views expressed in it should not be attributed to the Commission or to its participating governments.

The analysis in this issue is based on data and information available to the secretariat in late October 2001.

Economic Analysis Division  
United Nations Economic Commission for Europe  
Geneva